

The Influence of Inquiry Collaboration Pbl Learning Model on Students' Critical Thinking Ability

Darmuki, A.¹, Esteban, A. M.², Darwis, E. M.³, Hidayati, N. A.⁴ & Setiawan, A.⁵

^{1,4}Muria Kudus University, 59327, INDONESIA

^{2,3}Nueva Ecija University of Science and Technology, PHILIPPINES

⁵Universitas Muhammadiyah Malang, INDONESIA

*Corresponding Author: agusdarmuki@umk.ac.id

Received 30 May 2022, Revised 13 June 2022, Accepted 27 June 2022, Available online 28 June 2022

To Cite This Article:

<https://doi.org/10.53797/icccmjssh.v1i3.10.2022>

Abstract: The ability to think critically is one of the skills that is very important and needed in the 21st century. The aim of this research is to determine the influence of the collaborative inquiry PBL model on the critical thinking ability of Indonesian Language and Literature Education Study Program students. This research is a quasi-experimental type of quantitative research and the design used is post-test only control. The population of this research is all 3rd semester students taking the Language Research Methodology course. The sample in this research is class IIIA as an experimental class using the Problem Based Learning collaborative inquiry learning model and class IIIB as a control class using a conventional learning model. Class random sampling technique. The data collection used was a critical thinking ability test and a self-efficacy questionnaire. The analytical test used is two-way analysis of variance with unequal cells, with a significance level of 5%.

Keywords: Learning Models, PBL Collaborative Inquiry, Critical Thinking, Language Research Methodology

1. Introduction

The development of the Inquiry collaborative PBL learning model in educational research methodology courses has been developed based on the needs of lecturers and students in the Indonesian Language and Literature Education Study Program. The process of designing an Inquiry collaborative PBL learning model is carried out by combining syntax *PBL* and *Inquiry*. The stage of designing the Inquiry collaborative PBL learning model was carried out by combining the PBL learning model with *Inquiry*, (Ahsin, et. al 2020; Angelia, et. al 2020; Arukah, et. al 2020). The aim is for students to get double benefits from both learning models. Learning *PBL* rich in nuances of cooperation and trains students to have the ability to solve problems, discussions and presentations, meanwhile *Inquiry* requires and trains students to have the skills to find solutions to problems scientifically. Each model has characteristics and advantages, so that if they collaborate, students can get maximum benefits.

Learning syntax *PBL* There are five, namely orienting students to problems, organizing students to learn, guiding individual and group investigations, developing and presenting work results, and analyzing and evaluating the problem solving process, (Fathurohman, et. al 2020; Kara, et. al 2020; Satria, et. al 2020; Septaningsih, et. al 2020). Learning syntax *Inquiry* consists of six stages, namely problem orientation, formulating problems, making hypotheses, exploration (gathering information or data), testing hypotheses and making conclusions, (Arukah, et. al 2020; Dewanti, et. al 2020; Endiawan, et. al 2020). This mix basically combines activities *PBL* into the syntax *Inquiry*.

The draft collaborative Inquiry PBL learning model that has been developed is then validated by learning model experts and education experts to obtain input, (Fathurohman, 2020; Kara, et. al 2020; Purnaningtyas, et. al 2020; Purnaningtyas, et. al 2020). The input from these experts was used to revise the draft Inquiry collaborative PBL learning model, (Fathurohman, et. al 2020; Sofia, et. al 2020; Tamarudin, et. al 2020). Next, an FGD was carried out to find out the advantages and disadvantages as well as input from lecturers and policy makers. Input from lecturers in FGD activities is used to perfect the Inquiry collaborative PBL learning model before it is used in the field to determine the level of effectiveness of the model.

To determine the level of effectiveness of the collaborative PBL learning model, this inquiry was carried out

experimentally. The experiment was carried out in 2 classes, namely class A for the experimental group and class B students as the control class. This experiment was carried out from February 2024 to May 2024. This experiment was carried out involving 1 class A lecturer and the control class also involved 1 class B lecturer. The lecturers experimented with learning student educational research methodology using the Inquiry collaborative PBL learning model based on the draft Implementation Guide book Inquiry collaborative PBL learning for students in the Indonesian Language and Literature Education Study Program, FKIP UMK. Before carrying out the experiment, both the experimental group and the control group were given the same educational research methodology ability test (*pretest*), as well as afterwards (*posttest*). The pretest and posttest results were then tested for normality and homogeneity.

The normality test in this research consists of class A as well as class B. In the calculations, the Asymp Sig value is greater than the confidence level $\alpha = 0.05$. This means that the sample group comes from a normally distributed population.

2. Structure of References

The implementation of the Inquiry collaborative PBL learning model is a combination of PBL learning and Inquiry, so that several previous studies were related to learning outcomes *PBL* and *Inquiry* can be used as a reference. Previous research results show learning outcomes with *PBL* more effective than traditional in improving academic achievement (Sahin, 2010; Evcim & Ipek, 2013; Wilson et.al., 2017; Hoerunnisa et.al., 2017; Subiyantari et.al., 2019). A study on the effectiveness of learning outcomes also concluded that cooperative learning had the most positive impact on achievement variables (Darmuki, et al., 2017). The results of research using the Inquiry collaborative PBL model are also supported by the results of learning research *Inquiry* which shows that there are significant differences between the experimental group and the control group regarding average academic achievement, learning retention scores, and student perceptions of skills in carrying out investigations, both at the cognitive and affective levels (Dedonno, 2016; Indiatutik, 2016; Martaida et al. .al., 2017; Putri et.al., 2020; Gunawan et.al., 2020; This result is also confirmed by other research studies, namely that the inquiry learning method is better than traditional teaching methods in terms of academic achievement (Nuryakin & Riandi, 2017). Other research results show that students achieve better in understanding the content of learning through *Inquiry* compared to the lecture method (Rahmadani et.al., 2017; Rambe et.al. 2018).

3. Methodology

This research was conducted to determine the effect of implementing the Inquiry collaborative PBL learning model on student learning outcomes. The PBL learning model was carried out in the experimental group in class IID with a total of 38 students, while the control group in class IIA with a total of 36 students used the lecture method. Class IID as the experimental group and class IIA as the control group were carried out separately *cluster sampling* Previously, a balance test had been carried out on the entire population of level II of the Indonesian Language and Literature Education Study Program, Muria Kudus University and Muhammadiyah University of Malang for the 2023/2024 Academic Year. Learning outcomes ability test (*posttest*) The two groups treated with different methods were compared, so that it could be seen whether there was an influence of the application of the PBL learning model on students' learning outcomes.

The development of the Inquiry collaborative PBL learning model in educational research methodology courses has been developed based on the needs of lecturers and students in the Indonesian Language and Literature Education Study Program. The process of designing an Inquiry collaborative PBL learning model is carried out by combining syntax *PBL* and *Inquiry*. The stage of designing the Inquiry collaborative PBL learning model was carried out by combining the PBL learning model with *Inquiry*. The aim is for students to get double benefits from both learning models. Learning *PBL* rich in nuances of cooperation and trains students to have the ability to solve problems, discussions and presentations, meanwhile *Inquiry* requires and trains students to have the skills to find solutions to problems scientifically. Each model has characteristics and advantages, so that if they collaborate, students can get maximum benefits.

Data from educational research methodology ability tests were analyzed using *uji t* previously tested for normality and homogeneity. Statistically, both educational research methodologies ability scores are different because $F_{\text{calculation}} = 16.5875$ while $F_{\text{table}} = 3.91$ at the significance level $= 0.05$. Since $F_{\text{calculation}} > F_{\text{table}}$, it can show that Inquiry Collaborative PBL learning has a very significant influence on educational research methodology for Indonesian Language and Literature Education Study Program students, FKIP UMK.).

4. Results and Discussion

The aim of this research was to determine the effect of implementing the Inquiry collaborative PBL learning model on student learning outcomes. The PBL learning model was carried out in the experimental group in class IID with a total of 38 students, while the control group in class IIA with a total of 36 students used the lecture method. Class IID as the experimental group and class IIA as the control group were carried out separately *cluster sampling* Previously, a balance test had been carried out on the entire population of level II of the Indonesian Language and Literature Education Study Program, Muria Kudus University and Muhammadiyah University of Malang for the 2023/2024 Academic Year. Learning outcomes ability test (*posttest*) The two groups treated with different methods were compared, so that it could be seen whether there was an influence of the application of the PBL learning model on students' learning outcomes.

The development of the Inquiry collaborative PBL learning model in educational research methodology courses has been developed based on the needs of lecturers and students in the Indonesian Language and Literature Education Study Program. The process of designing an Inquiry collaborative PBL learning model is carried out by combining syntax *PBL* and *Inquiry*. The stage of designing the Inquiry collaborative PBL learning model was carried out by combining the PBL learning model with *Inquiry*. The aim is for students to get double benefits from both learning models. Learning *PBL* rich in nuances of cooperation and trains students to have the ability to solve problems, discussions and presentations, meanwhile *Inquiry* requires and trains students to have the skills to find solutions to problems scientifically. Each model has characteristics and advantages, so that if they collaborate, students can get maximum benefits.

Learning syntax *PBL* There are five, namely orienting students to problems, organizing students to learn, guiding individual and group investigations, developing and presenting work results, and analyzing and evaluating the problem solving process. Learning syntax *Inquiry* consists of six stages, namely problem orientation, formulating problems, making hypotheses, exploration (gathering information or data), testing hypotheses and making conclusions. This mix basically combines activities *PBL* into the syntax *Inquiry*. This collaboration resulted in the formation of a new syntax, namely the syntax of the collaborative Inquiry PBL learning model.

The draft collaborative Inquiry PBL learning model that has been developed is then validated by learning model experts and education experts to obtain input. The input from these experts was used to revise the draft Inquiry collaborative PBL learning model. Next, an FGD was carried out to find out the advantages and disadvantages as well as input from lecturers and policy makers. Input from lecturers in FGD activities is used to perfect the Inquiry collaborative PBL learning model before it is used in the field to determine the level of effectiveness of the model.

To determine the level of effectiveness of the collaborative PBL learning model, this inquiry was carried out experimentally. The experiment was carried out in 2 classes, namely class A for the experimental group and class B students as the control class. This experiment was carried out from February 2024 to May 2024. This experiment was carried out involving 1 class A lecturer and the control class also involved 1 class B lecturer. The lecturers experimented with learning student educational research methodology using the Inquiry collaborative PBL learning model based on the draft Implementation Guide book Inquiry collaborative PBL learning for students in the Indonesian Language and Literature Education Study Program, FKIP UMK. Before carrying out the experiment, both the experimental group and the control group were given the same educational research methodology ability test (*pretest*), as well as afterwards (*posttest*). The pretest and posttest results were then tested for normality and homogeneity.

Based on the results of the lecturer's perception questionnaire, it shows that in general the Inquiry collaborative PBL learning model regarding the importance of learning educational research methodology during the pretest was lower, 55% for the experimental group, 75% for the control group, while at the posttest the experimental group and the control group were the same at 100%.

Data from educational research methodology ability tests were analyzed using *uji t* previously tested for normality and homogeneity. Statistically, both educational research methodologies ability scores are different because $F_{\text{calculation}}$ was 16.5875 while F_{table} was 3.91 at the significance level $\alpha=0.05$. Since $F_{\text{calculation}} > F_{\text{table}}$, it can show that Inquiry collaborative PBL learning has a very significant influence on the educational research methodology of Indonesian Language and Literature Education Study Program students, FKIP UMK.

Based on the results of this research, lecturers need to adapt student learning needs to learning strategies. *Multiple models of instruction* is the practice of applying several different learning models in the teaching process. The choice of learning model to be used by a lecturer is determined by the characteristics of the learning material and learning objectives to be conveyed, the ability to meet student learning needs, and the ability to increase student learning capacity to optimal limits (Arifmiboy, 2018). In line with the views of Arend (2018: 111), it is impossible for there to be one teaching model that is considered superior for all educational purposes. In reality, each teaching model is often only suitable for certain types of learning, however these models can also be combined to help students achieve learning goals (Suryanti et. al., 2020: 76). No single approach is consistently better than another.

The implementation of the Inquiry collaborative PBL learning model is a combination of PBL learning and Inquiry, so that several previous studies were related to learning outcomes *PBL* and *Inquiry* can be used as a reference. Previous research results show learning outcomes with *PBL* more effective than traditional in improving academic achievement (Sahin, 2010; Evcim & Ipek, 2013; Wilson et.al., 2017; Hoerunnisa et.al., 2017; Subiyantari et.al., 2019). A study on the effectiveness of learning outcomes also concluded that cooperative learning had the most positive impact on achievement variables (Darmuki, et al., 2017).

The results of research using the Inquiry collaborative PBL model are also supported by the results of learning research *Inquiry* which shows that there are significant differences between the experimental group and the control group regarding average academic achievement, learning retention scores, and student perceptions of skills in carrying out investigations, both at the cognitive and affective levels (Dedonno, 2016; Indiasutik, 2016; Martaida et al. .al., 2017; Putri et.al., 2020; Gunawan et.al., 2020; This result is also confirmed by other research studies, namely that the inquiry learning method is better than traditional teaching methods in terms of academic achievement (Nuryakin & Riandi, 2017). Other research results show that students achieve better in understanding the content of learning through *Inquiry* compared to the lecture method (Rahmadani et.al., 2017; Rambe et.al. 2018).

This Inquiry collaborative PBL learning model has the potential to increase students' social interaction in learning educational research methodology. Social interaction is important considering the different characteristics of students in class (Darmuki & Hariyadi, 2019). The practice of using the Inquiry collaborative PBL model is to carry out scientific work in cooperative groups, so that this model is able to close the gap between upper and lower academic students, tensions caused by differences in student backgrounds, and is able to reduce the negative impact of competitive learning which gives birth to unhealthy competition (Sahin, 2010; Gunawan et.al., 2020). Student interaction in the PBL group is related to inquiry activities to discover concepts or facts through stages of scientific work, while in the PBL group social interaction is encouraged in problem solving activities through intense presentations and discussions to build a complete conceptual understanding of educational research methodology.

A literature review of studies on learning in the classroom reveals that the application of learning models using the Inquiry collaborative PBL method is more effective (Leyva & Riu, 2016; Yemi et. al., 2018; Subiyantari et. al., 2019(Jigsaw); Rambe et. al., 2018; Wardono et.al., 2020; Winarni et.al., 2020; Gunawan & Lestari, 2020 (Discovery Learning)). The research results of (Leung et.al. 2018) have collaborated with the discovery learning model with the Geogebra model assistant to show that learning activities are effective and enjoyable. Research by (Suryanti et.al. 2020) shows that the discovery learning model which is collaborated with the problem solving learning model shows an increase in students' abilities and understanding in mastering material concepts well and optimally. Previous scientific studies conducted by (Darmuki & Hariyadi 2019) in classroom learning using the PBL learning model can maximize student learning outcomes. Learning strategies which include learning models applied by lecturers in teaching and learning activities will influence the success of learning objectives. The lecturer's ability to apply learning models will make it easier for students to receive learning (Darmuki et al., 2018).

The weakness of this research is that the learning process in the classroom lies in the lecturer's commitment when implementing the collaborative Inquiry PBL learning model where the combination of the PBL learning model is more dominant than the Inquiry learning model. Apart from that, another weakness during the learning process is that students lack a competitive atmosphere so that there are some students who dominate learning in class even though in the end all students are actively learning. The strength of this research lies in social interaction in learning and students' needs in learning so that it can build a complete understanding of students' concepts regarding educational research methodology through problem solving. The application of the Inquiry collaborative PBL learning model in this research is proven by the Inquiry collaboration PBL learning model applied by lecturers in learning educational research methodology. It turns out that students find it easier to understand educational research methodology courses so that student competence is better.

The results of this research indicate that the application of the Inquiry collaborative PBL learning model in educational research methodology learning is able to improve students' critical thinking abilities. This research is in line with research conducted by (Palupi et al. 2020; Saputra et al. 2019; Azizah et al. 2018) who stated that there was an increase in students' and university students' critical thinking abilities through collaborative constructivist learning. Other research that supports this research is research conducted by (Utami & Giarti, 2020) which states that through collaborative learning and critical thinking, learning outcomes including thinking abilities can be improved. This research is also strengthened by research conducted by (Prayoga & Setyaningtyas, 2021) regarding the use of the collaborative Inquiry PBL model to improve critical thinking skills and learning outcomes. It is proven by the data obtained that there has been a significant increase in each cycle.

5. Conclusion

The results of this research are very important for learning the Educational Research Methodology course. The Inquiry collaborative PBL model has a positive influence on students' critical thinking abilities and the effectiveness of learning in the classroom. It can be concluded that the Inquiry collaborative PBL model is more effective than the lecture model because it is able to improve students' critical thinking skills in educational research methodology courses in the Indonesian Language and Literature Education Study Program. This research provides an overview for students, lecturers and academics about improving the quality of the learning process and learning outcomes when the collaborative Inquiry PBL model is applied in the classroom. This cannot be separated from the role of lecturers, students, appropriate learning models or methods in producing good learning outcomes, and other factors. Further research is needed to test the practicality and effectiveness of PBL and other learning models to determine critical thinking abilities and student learning outcomes in educational research methodology courses. The implication of this research is that the collaborative inquiry PBL model can be applied in other learning that can develop students' critical thinking abilities. It can be applied in other learning that can develop students' critical thinking abilities.

Acknowledgement

The authors would like to thank the fellow authors and organizations whose intellectual properties were utilized for this study.

Conflict of Interest

The authors declare no conflicts of interest.

References

- Affandi, Y., Darmuki, A., & Hariyadi, A. (2022). The Evaluation of JIDI (Jigsaw Discovery) Learning Model In The Course of Qur'an Qafsir. *International Journal of Instruction*, 15(1), 799-820. <https://doi.org/10.29333/iji.2022.15146a>
- Afifah, E. P., Wahyudi, W., & Setiawan, Y. (2019). Efektivitas Problem Based Learning dan Problem Solving Terhadap Kemampuan Berpikir Kritis Siswa Kelas V dalam Pembelajaran Matematika [The Effectiveness of Problem Based Learning and Problem Solving on the Critical Thinking Skills of Class V Students in Learning Mathematics]. *MUST: Journal of Mathematics Education, Science and Technology*, 4(1), 95-107.
- Afiana, J., Permanasari, A., & Fitriani, A. (2016). Project Based Learning Integrated to STEM to Enhance Elementary School's Students Scientific Literacy. *Jurnal Pendidikan IPA Indonesia*, 5(2), 261-267.
- Ahsin, M. N., & Fathurohman, I. (2020). Penerapan Blended Learning dengan Moodle dan Media Website dalam Pembelajaran Jurnalistik Daring. *Sasando: Jurnal Bahasa, Sastra Indonesia, dan Pengajarannya Lembaga Penelitian dan Pengabdian Masyarakat Universitas Pancasakti Tegal*, 3(2), 33-46. <https://doi.org/10.24905/sasando.v3i2.126>
- Angelia, B., Widiyanto, E., & Fathurohman, I. (2020). Kohesi dan Koherensi Pada Buku Pengajaran Bipa Tingkt C1. In *Prosiding Seminar Internasional Seminar Kepakaran Bahasa Indonesia Untuk Penutur Asing (SEMAR BIPA)* (Vol. 3, No. 1, pp. 31-37). <https://conference.umk.ac.id/index.php/semarbipa/article/view/269>
- Arukah, D. W., Fathurohman, I., & Kuryanto, M. S. (2020). Peningkatan Hasil Belajar Siswa Kelas IV Sekolah Dasar Negeri 2 Karangbener Menggunakan Model Think Pairs Share. *EduBase: Journal of Basic Education*, 1(2), 127-135. <https://doi.org/10.47453/edubase.v1i2.141>
- Arukah, D. W., Fathurohman, I., & Kuryanto, M. S. (2020, October). Peningkatan Hasil Belajar Siswa dengan Menggunakan Media Ledu. In *Prosiding Seminar dan Diskusi Pendidikan Dasar*. <https://journal.unj.ac.id/unj/index.php/psdpd/article/view/17738>
- Astuti, W. P. (2018). Efektivitas Model Pembelajaran Problem Based Learning Dan Problem Solving Terhadap Kemampuan Berpikir Kreatif Matematika Siswa Kelas 4 [The Effectiveness of Problem Based Learning and Problem Solving Learning Models on the Ability to Think Creative Mathematics of Grade 4 Students]. *Jurnal Imiah Pendidikan dan Pembelajaran*, 2(2), 159-166.
- Azizah, L. I. R., Sugiyanti, S., & Happy, N. (2019). Efektivitas Model Pembelajaran Problem Based Learning (PBL) dan Guided Inquiry terhadap Kemampuan Berpikir Kritis Matematis Siswa [The Effectiveness of Problem Based Learning (PBL) and Guided Inquiry Learning Models on Students' Mathematical Critical Thinking Ability]. *Imajiner: Jurnal Matematika dan Pendidikan Matematika*, 1(4), 30-36.
- Azizah, N. Ahmad Hariyadi. (2022). Peran Guru dalam Mewujudkan Pembelajaran Literasi di Era Revolusi 4.0 Mewujudkan Masyarakat 5.0 Society. *Seminar Nasional Peran Bahasa dan Sastra dalam industry Kreatif Indonesia di Era 5.0* 1 (1) 107-112
- Baran, M., Maskan, A., & Yaşar, S. (2018). Learning Physics Through Project-Based Learning Game Techniques. *International Journal of Instruction*, 11(2), 221-234. <https://doi.org/10.12973/iji.2018.11215a>
- Budiyono. (2021). *Pengantar Metodologi Penelitian Pendidikan [Introduction to Educational Research Methodology]*. Surakarta: UNS Press.
- Buitrago-Flórez, F., Danies, G., Restrepo, S., & Hernández, C. (2021). Fostering 21st Century Competences Through Computational Thinking and Active Learning: a Mixed Method Study. *International Journal of Instruction*, 14(3), 737-754. <https://doi.org/10.29333/iji.2021.14343a>
- Chalkiadaki, A. (2018). A Systematic Literature Review of 21st Century Skills and Competencies in Primary Education. *International Journal of Instruction*, 11(3), 1-16. <https://doi.org/10.12973/iji.2018.1131a>

- Choden, T., & Kijkuakul, S. (2020). Blending Problem Based Learning with Scientific Argumentation to Enhance Students' Understanding of Basic Genetics. *International Journal of Instruction*, 13(1), 445-462. <https://doi.org/10.29333/iji.2020.13129a>
- Darmuki, A. & Ahmad Hariyadi. (2019). Eksperimentasi Model Pembelajaran Jucama Ditinjau Dari Gaya Belajar Terhadap Prestasi Belajar Mahasiswa Mata Kuliah Berbicara Di Prodi PBSI IKIP PGRI Bojonegoro [Experimental Research on Jucama Learning Model viewed from Students' Learning Styles towards Their Learning Achievement in the Subject of Speaking]. *Kredo*, 3(1), 62-72.
- Darmuki, A. & Hidayati N.A. (2019). An Investigation of The Cooperative Learning Using Audio Visual Media in Speaking Skill Subject. *ICSTI*, 121-126. <https://eudl.eu/doi/10.4108/eai.19-10-2018.2282555>
- Darmuki, A. & Hidayati, N.A. (2019). Peningkatan Kemampuan Berbicara Menggunakan Model Kooperatif Tipe NHT pada Mahasiswa Tingkat I-A Prodi PBSI IKIP PGRI Bojonegoro Tahun Akademik 2018/2019 [The Improvement of Speaking Skill using NHT Cooperative Model at First Year Students of Indonesian Language and Literature Department]. *Jurnal Pendidikan Edutama*, 6(2), 9-18. <http://dx.doi.org/10.30734/jpe.v6i2.453>
- Darmuki, A., Ahmad Hariyadi, Nur Alfin Hidayati. (2019). Developing Beach Ball Group Investigations Cooperative Learning Model to Improve Social Skill in Speaking Course. *EUDL*, 120-128. <http://dx.doi.org/10.4108/eai.27-4-2019.2286784>
- Darmuki, A., Ahmad Hariyadi. (2019). Peningkatan Keterampilan Berbicara Menggunakan Model Kooperatif Tipe Jigsaw pada Mahasiswa PBSI Tingkat IB IKIP PGRI Bojonegoro Tahun Akademik 2018/2019 [The Improvement of Speaking Ability using Jigsaw Cooperative Model at First Year Studetns of Indonesian Language and Literature Department. *Kredo*, 2(2), 256-267.
- Darmuki, A., Andayani, Joko Nurkamto, Kundharu Saddhono. (2017). Evaluating Information-Processing-Based Learning Cooperative Model on Speaking Skill Course. *Journal of Language Teaching and Reasearch*, 8(1), 44-51. <http://www.academypublication.com/issues2/jltr/vol08/01/06.pdf>
- Darmuki, A., Andayani, Joko Nurkamto, Kundharu Saddhono. (2018). The Development and Evaluation of Speaking Learning Model by Cooperative Approach. *International Journal of Instruction*, 11(2), 115-128. <https://doi.org/10.12973/iji.2018.1129a>
- Dermawan A. (2018). *Metodologi Ilmu Dakwah [Da'wah Science Methodology]*. Yogyakarta: Lesfi.
- Dewanti, F. C., Ahsin, M. N., & Fathurohman, I. (2020, November). Penggunaan Lagu Karya Band Wali Sebagai Upaya Meningkatkan Kosakata Bahasa Indonesia Bagi Penutur Asing. In *Prosiding Seminar Internasional Seminar Kepakaran Bahasa Indonesia Untuk Penutur Asing (SEMAR BIPA)* (Vol. 3, No. 1, pp. 149-156). <https://conference.umk.ac.id/index.php/semarbipa/article/view/284>
- Endiawan, A. S., Fathurohman, I., & Santoso, S. (2020). Pengembangan Media Pembelajaran Literasi Cergam Berbasis E-Book Android Terhadap Minat Baca Siswa Kelas III SD. *Primary: Jurnal Pendidikan Guru Sekolah Dasar*, 9(4), 564-570.
- Fathurohman, I. (2020). Pembelajaran mata kuliah keterampilan berbahasa indonesia melalui live streaming youtube berbasis Open Broadcast Software dan Whatsapp di era pandemi Covid 19. *Jurnal Educatio FKIP UNMA*, 6(2), 668-675. <https://doi.org/10.31949/educatio.v6i2.704>
- Fathurohman, I., & Cahyaningsih, R. D. (2021). Development of Authentic Assessment Instrument for Improving Extensive Capacity of Metacognitive Perspective. *Asian Journal of Assessment in Teaching and Learning*, 11(1), 13-21.
- Fathurohman, I., & Cahyaningsih, R. D. (2021). Development of Authentic Assessment Instrument for Improving Extensive Capacity of Metacognitive Perspective. *Asian Journal of Assessment in Teaching and Learning*, 11(1), 13-21.
- Fathurohman, I., & Purbasari, I. (2020). Peningkatan Hasil Belajar Siswa SDN 5 Gondoharum Kudus Melalui Model TGT dan Media DaperR. *Jurnal Ilmiah Wahana Pendidikan*, 6(3), 264-274. <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.3960155>
- Fathurohman, I., & Setiawan, D. (2020). The Utilization of Culture Map Board Media To Improve Teachers' Skills In Elementary School. *Journal of Education Technology*, 4(3), 279-284. <https://doi.org/10.23887/jet.v4i3.28456>

- Fatmawati, E. T., & Sujatmika, S. (2018). Efektivitas Pembelajaran Problem Based Learning Terhadap Hasil Belajar IPA Ditinjau Dari Kemampuan Berpikir Kritis [The Effectiveness of Problem Based Learning Against Science Learning Outcomes in View of Critical Thinking Ability]. *Wacana Akademika: Majalah Ilmiah Kependidikan*, 2(2), 163-171.
- Fatmawati, E. T., & Sujatmika, S. (2018). Efektivitas Pembelajaran Problem Based Learning Terhadap Hasil Belajar IPA Ditinjau Dari Kemampuan Berpikir Kritis [The Effectiveness of Problem Based Learning Against Science Learning Outcomes in View of Critical Thinking Ability]. *Wacana Akademika: Majalah Ilmiah Kependidikan*, 2(2), 163-171.
- Fitriani, S. Nurhanurawati, N. Coesamin, M. *Pengaruh Kemampuan Awal dan Motivasi Belajar Terhadap Kemampuan Komunikasi Matematis Siswa. Jurnal Pendidikan Matematika* Vol. 9 (1) Hal. 31-41. Online Publication. DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.23960/mtk/v9i1.pp31-41>
- Gunawan, G., Harjono, A., Kusdiastuti, M., Nisyah M., & Herayanti, L. (2019). Increasing Students' Critical Thinking Skills in Physics Using a Guided Inquiry Model Combined with an Advanced Organizer. *J of Adv Res in Dyn & Cont Sys*, 11(7), 313-320.
- Hariyadi, A., & Darmuki, A. (2019). Prestasi dan Motivasi Belajar dengan Konsep Diri. *Prosiding Seminar Nasional Penguatan Muatan Lokal Bahasa Daerah sebagai Pondasi Pendidikan Karakter Generasi Milenial*. PGSD UMK 2019, 280-286.
- Hariyadi, A., Fuadul, M., & Aldinda Putri (2021) Pembelajaran Kooperatif Berbantuan Media Audio Visual Pada Mata Kuliah Pendidikan Ilmu Pengetahuan Sosial. *Refleksi Edukatika* Vol 12(1) 110-116
- Hariyadi, Ahmad. (2018). User Of Smart Ladder Snanke Media to Improve Student Learning Outcomes Of IV Grade Students of State Elementary School I Doropayung Pancur Rembang. *Refleksi Edukatika*. Vol. 9 (1), 107-111
- Hariyadi, Ahmad. (2022). Pendidikan Pancasila Menanamkan Nilai-nilai Karakter dan Budaya. Surabaya CV. Aksara Global
- Hasanah, U, Sarjono, Ahmad Hariyadi. (2021). Pengaruh Model Problem Based Learning Terhadap Prestasi Belajar IPS SMP Taruna Kedung Adem. *Aksara*. Vol. 7(1). 43-52.
- Hidayati, N. A. (2020). Penerapan Metode Mind Map Berbasis Drill Untuk Meningkatkan Kemampuan Berbicara Mahasiswa di Prodi PBSI IKIP PGRI Bojonegoro . *Jurnal Educatio FKIP UNMA*, 6(2), 462-468.
- Hidayati, N. A. (2021). Peningkatan Keterampilan Pidato Melalui Metode Demonstrasi Berbantuan Unggah Tugas Video di Youtube. *Jurnal Educatio FKIP UNMA*, 7(4), 1738-1744.
- Irdalisa, Paidi, & Djukri. (2020). Implementation of Technology-based Guided Inquiry to Improve TPACK among Prospective Biology Teachers. *International Journal of Instruction*, 13(2), 33-44.
- Ju, H., & Choi, I. (2018). The role of Argumentation in Hypothetico-Deductive Reasoning During Problem-Based Learning in Medical Education: A Conceptual Framework. *Interdisciplinary J. of Problem-based Learning*, 12(1), 1-18.
- Kara, R. B., Fathurohman, I., & Fajrie, N. (2020). Improving Poem Writing Skill Through Smart Ludo Media For Grade IV Students. *Jurnal Ilmiah Sekolah Dasar*, 4(3), 496-504. <https://doi.org/10.23887/jisd.v4i3.27538>
- Kara, R. B., Fathurohman, I., & Fajrie, N. (2020). Upaya Meningkatkan Keterampilan Menulis Puisi melalui Media Ludo Pintar. *Journal of Education Action Research*, 4(3), 363-370. <https://doi.org/10.23887/jeaar.v4i3.27231>
- Kemalsyah, M., Moh Solehaddin, Ahmad Hariyadi, Jenuri, Dina MS. (2022). An Analysis of Factors that Affectefl Students' Writing Skill. *Jurnal Qalamuna: Jurnal Pendidikan, Sosial, dan Agama*. 14 (2)
- Kleinig, J. (2018). Trust and Critical Thinking. *Educational Philosophy and Theory*, 50(2), 133-143, <https://doi.org/10.1080/00131857.2016.1144167>
- Liu, O. L., Shaw, A., Gu, L., Li, G., Hu, S., Yu, N., Ma, L., Xu, C., Guo, F., Su, Q., Kardanovaj, E., Chirikov, I., Shi, J., Shi, Z., Wang, H., & Loyalka, P. (2018). Assessing College Critical Thinking: Preliminary Results from the Chinese HEIghten Critical Thinking Assessment. *Higher Education Research & Development*, 37(5), 999-1014.

<https://doi.org/10.1080/07294360.2018.1467381>

Menggo, S., Suastra, I. M., Budiarsa, M., & Padmadewi, N. N. (2019). Needs Analysis of Academic-English Speaking Material in Promoting 21st Century Skills. *International Journal of Instruction*, 12(2), 739-754. <https://doi.org/10.29333/iji.2019.12247a>.

Munzier Suparta dkk. (2020). Metode Dakwah [Da'wah Method], Jakarta: Rahma Semesta.

Muskita, M., Subali, B., & Djukri. (2020). Effects of Worksheets Base the Levels of Inquiry in Improving Critical and Creative Thinking. *International Journal of Instruction*, 13(2), 519-532. <https://doi.org/10.29333/iji.2020.13236a>

Nugraheni, L., Waluyo, H. J., & Wardani, N. E. (2022). The Influence of Wayang Beber (The Legend of Wasis Joyokusumo) as a Character-Based Learning Media on Students' Critical Thinking Ability. *International Journal of Instruction*, 15(3), 267-290.

Ojaleye, O. & Awofala, A.O.A. (2018). Blended Learning and Problem-Based Learning Instructional Strategies as Determinants of Senior econdary School Students' Achievement in Algebra. *International Journal of Research in Education and Science (IJRES)*, 4(2), 486-501.

Palupi, B. S., Subiyantoro, S., Rukayah, & Triyanto. (2020). The Effectiveness of Guided Inquiry Learning (GIL) and Problem-Based Learning (PBL) for Explanatory Writing Skill. *International Journal of Instruction*, 13(1), 713-730. <https://doi.org/10.29333/iji.2020.13146a>

Perdana, R., Rudibyani, R. B., Budiyo, Sajidan, & Sukarmin. (2020). The Effectiveness of Inquiry Social Complexity to Improving Critical and Creative Thinking Skills of Senior High School Students. *International Journal of Instruction*, 13(4), 477-490. <https://doi.org/10.29333/iji.2020.13430a>

Persky, A. M., Medina, M. S., & Castleberry, A. N. (2019). Developing Critical Thinking Skills in Pharmacy Students. *American Journal of Pharmaceutical Education*, 83(2), 7033. <https://doi.org/10.5688/ajpe7033>

Prasasti, D. E., Koeswanti, H. D., & Giarti, S. (2019). Peningkatan Keterampilan Berpikir Kritis dan Hasil Belajar Matematika melalui Model Discovery Learning di Kelas IV SD. *Jurnal Basicedu*, 3(1), 174-179.

Prayoga, A., & Setyaningtyas, E. W. (2021). Keefektifan Model Pembelajaran Problem Based Learning dan Problem Solving Terhadap Kemampuan Berpikir Kritis Matematika Siswa Kelas V. *Jurnal Cendekia: Jurnal Pendidikan Matematika*, 5(3), 2652–2665. <https://doi.org/10.31004/cendekia.v5i3.938>

Purnaningtyas, A. R. I. D., Fathurohman, I., & Kuryanto, M. S. (2020, October). Pemanfaatan Media Unos dan Model Pembelajaran Teams Games Tournament untuk Peningkatan Keterampilan Mengajar Guru di SD Negeri Geritan Pati. In *Prosiding Seminar dan Diskusi Pendidikan Dasar*. <https://journal.unj.ac.id/unj/index.php/psdpd/article/view/17737>

Purnaningtyas, A. R. I. D., Fathurohman, I., & Kuryanto, M. S. (2020). Peningkatan Hasil Belajar melalui Model Teams Games Tournament Berbantuan Media Unos pada Siswa Kelas IV Sekolah Dasar. *Jurnal Pendidikan Dasar Borneo (Judikdas Borneo)*, 2(2), 15-23. <https://doi.org/10.35334/judikdas%20borneo.v2i2.1479>

Putri, Eva Shahira, Ahmad H. (2022). Peranan Tradisi untuk Membangun Karakter Peserta Didik Melalui Vidio Animasi Era 5.0. *Seminar Nasional Revitalisasi Media Pembelajaran Bahasa Indonesia di Era 5.0 Berbasis kurikulum merdeka belajar 1* (1). 38-44

Ramadhani, I. R., Fathurohman, I., & Fardani, M. A. (2020). Efek Penggunaan Smartphone Berkelanjutan pada Masa Pandemi Covid-19 terhadap Perilaku Anak. *Jurnal Amal Pendidikan*, 1(2), 96-105.

Santyasa, I. W., Rapi, N. K., & Sara, I. W. W. (2020). PBL and Academic Procrastination of Students in Learning Physics. *International Journal of Instruction*, 13(1), 489-508. <https://doi.org/10.29333/iji.2020.13132a>

Saputra, M. D., Joyoatmojo, S., Wardani, D. K., & Sangka, K. B. (2019). Developing Critical-Thinking Skills Through the Collaboration of Jigsaw Model with Problem-Based Learning Model. *International Journal of Instruction*, 12(1), 1077-1094.

- Sari, S. P., Koeswanti, H. D., & Giarti, S. (2019). Penerapan Model Pembelajaran Problem Based Learning Untuk Meningkatkan Keterampilan Berpikir Kritis Pada Muatan Matematika Kelas 4 [Application of Problem Based Learning Learning Models to Improve Critical Thinking Skills in Grade 4 Mathematics Content]. *Jurnal Basicedu*, 3(2), 378- 386.
- Sari, Y. I., Sumarmi., Utomo, D. H., & Astina, I K. (2021). The Effect of Problem Based Learning on Problem Solving and Scientific Writing Skills. *International Journal of Instruction*, 14(2), 11-26. <https://doi.org/10.29333/iji.2021.1422a>
- Satria, E. P., Fathurohman, I., & Ardianti, S. D. (2020). Meningkatkan hasil belajar siswa SD melalui model teams games tournament dan media scrapbook. *EduBasic Journal: Jurnal Pendidikan Dasar*, 2(1), 45-51. <https://doi.org/10.17509/ebj.v2i1.26954>
- Septaningsih, U., Fathurohman, I., & Setiawan, D. (2020). Keterampilan Guru Melalui Model Picture and Picture Berbantuan Media Roda Putar Kelas IV SDN Wonorejo 2 Demak. *Naturalistic: Jurnal Kajian dan Penelitian Pendidikan dan Pembelajaran*, 5(1), 661-666. <https://doi.org/10.35568/naturalistic.v5i1.887>
- Setyorini, R., Suryanto, E., Saddhono, K., Wulandari, Y., Purwanto, W. E., Riyanto, S., & Sukini, S. Cybersastra Phenomenon as an Implementastiton of Information and Communication Technology (ICT) in Literary Education. *International Journal of Engineering & Technology*.
- Silviariza, W. Y., Sumarmi., & Handoyo, B. (2021). Improving Critical Thinking Skills of Geography Students with Spatial Problem Based Learning (SPBL). *International Journal of Instruction*, 14(3),133-152. <https://doi.org/10.29333/iji.2021.1438a>
- Sofia, E. M., Fathurohman, I., & Purbasari, I. (2020). Penerapan Model Contextual Teaching And Learning Terhadap Peningkatan Keterampilan Menulis Pendapat Pribadi. *Kredo: Jurnal Ilmiah Bahasa dan Sastra*, 3(2), 249-262. <https://doi.org/10.24176/kredo.v3i2.4783>
- Styers, M. L., Van Zandt, P. A., & Hayden, K. L. (2018). Active Learning in Flipped Life Science Courses Promotes Development of Critical Thinking Skills. *CBE Life Sciences Education*, 17(3), ar39. <https://doi.org/10.1187/cbe.16-11-0332>
- Sugiarti., & Husain, H. (2021). An Influence of The Contextual-Based Discovery Learning Model on The Academic Honesty of High School Students. *International Journal of Instruction*, 14(3), 645-660. <https://doi.org/10.29333/iji.2021.14338a>
- Sugiyono. (2021). Metode penelitian kuantitatif, kualitatif, dan R&D [Quantitative, qualitative, and R&D research methods]. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Sukmadinata, Nana Syaodih. (2021). Metode Penelitian Pendidikan [Educational Research Methods]. Bandung: Remaja Rosda Karya
- Sumardi, L., Rohman, A., & Wahyudiati, D. (2020). Does the Teaching and Learning Process in Primary Schools Correspond to the Characteristics of the 21st Century Learning? *International Journal of Instruction*, 13(3), 357-370. <https://doi.org/10.29333/iji.2020.13325a>
- Supena, I., Darmuki, A., & Hariyadi A. (2021). The Influence of 4C (Constructive, Critical, Creativity, Collaborative) Learning Model on Students' Learning Outcomes. *International Journal of Instruction*, 14(4), 1-21.
- Tamarudin, A. (2020). Analisis faktor otentik kesulitan belajar program linier berbasis problem-based learning. *Anargya: Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan Matematika*, 3(1), 8-14. <https://doi.org/10.24176/anargya.v3i1.4142>
- Tapung, M., Maryani, E., & Supriatna, N. (2018). Improving Students' Critical Thinking Skills in Controlling Social Problems Through The Development of The Emancipatory Learning Model for Junior High School Social Studies in Manggarai. *Journal of Social Studies Education Research*, 9(3), 162–176. <https://doi.org/10.17499/jsser.23826>.
- Triana, D., Anggraito, Y. U., & Ridlo, S. (2020). Effectiveness of environmental change learning tools based on STEM-Inkuiri towards 4C skills of students. *Journal of Innovative Science Education*, 9(2), 181–187. <https://doi.org/10.15294/JISE.V8I3.34048>.

Tuhuteru, Laros, Alam Bakti K., Sumarni R., Vioneta CP., Ahmad Hariyadi. (2023). Peran Media Sosial Terhadap Pembentukan Karakter pada Anak Usia Dini. *Judika (Jurnal Pendidikan Unsika)* 11 (1)

Utami, R. A., & Giarti, S. (2020). Efektivitas Model Pembelajaran Problem Based Learning (PBL) Dan Discovery Learning Ditinjau Dari Keterampilan Berpikir Kritis Siswa Kelas 5 SD [The Effectiveness of Problem Based Learning (PBL) and Discovery Learning Models in View of the Critical Thinking Skills of Grade 5 Elementary School Students]. *PeTeKa*, 3(1), 1–8. <https://doi.org/10.31604/ptk.v3i1.1-8>.

Wahyu, Arukah Dwi, Irfai Fathurohman, Moh. Syaffruddin K. (2020). Peningkatan Hasil Belajar Siswa dengan Menggunakan Media Ledu. *Proseding Seminar dan Diskusi Pendidikan Dasar*.

Wedekaningsih, A., Koeswanti, H. D., & Giarti, S. (2019). Penerapan Model Pembelajaran Discovery Learning untuk Meningkatkan Keterampilan Berpikir Kritis dan Hasil Belajar Matematika Peserta Didik. *Jurnal Basicedu*, 3(1), 21 – 26. <https://doi.org/10.31004/basicedu.v3i1.73>.

Winarni, E. W., Hambali, D., & Purwandari, E. P. (2020). Analysis of Language and Scientific Literacy Skills for 4th Grade Elementary School Students Through Discovery Learning and ICT Media. *International Journal of Instruction*, 13(2), 213-222. <https://doi.org/10.29333/iji.2020.13215a>